

## Question 2: Is it scientifically justified to conclude that mercury in dental amalgam could cause serious effects on human health due to mercury releases into the environment?

Mercury coming from dental amalgam as well as from many other sources, ubiquitously distributed in the environment, can be taken up by the general human population via food, water and air. Regarding the contribution of environmental mercury coming from dental amalgam use, it can be concluded that emissions of Hg to soil are not considered as a concern regarding human health. Regarding inhalation, amalgam use will also make only a limited contribution to the overall human inhalation exposure. The contribution of amalgam use to the concentrations of methyl mercury found in fish is not known and consequently no clear conclusion on possible health risks is possible. However SCHER estimated three scenarios in fish based on five hypothetical values for the methylation rate of mercury. SCHER also noted that all additional sources which add to the methyl mercury burden in humans may increase the number of people at risk, thus respecting the more conservative WFD threshold would contribute to the prevention of human health effects.

The SCHER report does not take into consideration a public health issue directly related to dental mercury: the poisoning of dentists and of their assistants. Autopsies revealed very high mercury levels in pituitary, occipital cortex and renal cortex of dental personnel [Nylander 1989]. High levels of mercury in dentists blood have been noted [Tezel 2001 Kasraei 2010] as well as in their urine - the latter being the best indicator of short-term exposure to inorganic mercury [Lehto 1989 , Steinberg 1995 Karahalil 2005 de Oliveira 2010]. Urinary mercury levels for dental assistants are even higher [Nilsson 1986]. Although the levels of urinary mercury remain relatively low for a majority of professionals, levels for some of these individuals are similar to those for which effects on kidneys and central nervous system have been reported [Skare 1990] . In addition, some studies have demonstrated symptoms due to mercury for these workers but not correlated with mercury levels measured in urine [ Ritchie 2004].

Mercury levels in urine do not actually reflect the mercury accumulated in the body. A mobilization test with referenced chelator (ASD) is a much better indicator of the body burden of mercury as well as kidney and cognitive problems associated with it among dentists and their assistants [Gonzalez- Ramirez 1995]. This test reveals a urinary mercury concentration multiplied by 10 for dentists – while only multiplied by an average of 5.9 for dental wearers and 5.3 for controls without amalgams [Molin 1991]. Again, the increase in the urinary excretion of mercury is even greater among dental assistant [Zander 1992]. The risk of mercury absorption by professionals does not only correspond to the number of new amalgam based fillings , but also to the circumstances under which they work on the existing amalgam. Unfortunately a majority of professionals do not take sufficient measures to protect themselves [Colson , 2012, Warwick 2013] .

On the other hand , studies on dental professionals have shown that at comparable exposure, genetic factors may increase mercury effects on cognitive sphere, mood and behavior [Heyer 2008 , Echeverria 2006 , Echeverria 2005 , Heyer 2004 , Echeverria 1995] Several studies have shown that dentists mercury exposure is associated with an increased prevalence of many symptoms [Neghab 2011 , Ritchie 2002].

In particular, many consistent studies find sensory, cognitive, neurological and psychosomatic disorders among dentists [Schach 2003, Ritchie 1995 Langworth 1997 Ngim 1992 Uzzell 1986, Shapiro 1982, Bittner 1998, Aydin 2003 Canto- Pereira 2005] and even more among dental assistants [Moen 2008, 2009 Hilt].

Publications observe an increased proportion of suicides among male dentists [Arnetz 1987, Meltzer 2008, Petersen 2008], others find increased kidney problems increased among dentists [Verschoor 1988 Samir 2011], and some increased cancer risks among dentists [Simning 2007], including brain cancers[2002 Navas Navas 2002 Ahlbom 1986 ], reproductive system cancers (breast or testicular) [Eriksson 1998 Rix 1996] and skin cancer [Linet 1995 Vågerö 1990].

Dental assistants and female dentists may suffer from reproductive disorders [Jones 2007, Rowland 1994 Lindbohm 2007] and we know that occupational exposure to mercury significantly increases the risk of hypertension in pregnant women and small weight birth malformation of child, neural tube defects and dead babies [ Pan 2007 Figà - Talamanca 2006].

## Bibliographie

Ahlbom A, Norell S, Rodvall Y. et al **Dentists, dental nurses, and brain tumours.** BMJ (Clin Res Ed) 1986. 292662.

Arnetz BB, Hörte LG, Hedberg A, Malker H. **Suicide among Swedish dentists.** A ten-year follow-up study. Scand J Soc Med. 1987;15(4):243-6.

Aydin N, Karaoglanoglu S, Yigit A, Keles MS, Kirpinar I, Seven N. **Neuropsychological effects of low mercury exposure in dental staff in Erzurum, Turkey.** Int Dent J. 2003 Apr;53(2):85-91.

Bittner ACJ, Echeverria D, Woods JS: **Behavioral effects of low-level exposure to Hg0 among dental professional: a cross-study evaluation of psychomotor effects.** *Neurotoxicol Teratol* 1998, **17**:161-168.

Canto-Pereira LH, Lago M, Costa MF, Rodrigues AR, Saito CA, Silveira LC, Ventura DF. **Visual impairment on dentists related to occupational mercury exposure.** Environ Toxicol Pharmacol. 2005 May;19(3):517-22.

Colson DG. **A safe protocol for amalgam removal.** J Environ Public Health. 2012;2012:517391.

de Oliveira MT, Pereira JR, Ghizoni JS, Bittencourt ST, Molina GO. **Effects from exposure to dental amalgam on systemic mercury levels in patients and dental school students.** Photomed Laser Surg. 2010 Oct;28 Suppl 2:S111-4.

Echeverria D, Woods JS, Heyer NJ, Rohlman D, Farin FM, Li T, Garabedian CE. **The association between a genetic polymorphism of coproporphyrinogen oxidase, dental mercury exposure and neurobehavioral response in humans.** Neurotoxicol Teratol. 2006 Jan-Feb;28(1):39-48.

Echeverria D, Woods JS, Heyer NJ, Rohlman DS, Farin FM, Bittner AC Jr, Li T, Garabedian C. **Chronic low-level mercury exposure, BDNF polymorphism, and associations with cognitive and motor function.** Neurotoxicol Teratol. 2005 Nov-Dec;27(6):781-96.

Echeverria D, Heyer NJ, Martin MD, Naleway CA, Woods JS, Bittner AC Jr. **Behavioral effects of low-level exposure to elemental Hg among dentists.** Neurotoxicol Teratol. 1995 Mar-Apr;17(2):161-8.

Eriksson M, Hardell L, Malmer H. et al **Increased cancer incidence in physicians, dentists, and health care workers.** *Oncol Rep* 1998. 51413–1418.1418.

Figà-Talamanca I. **Occupational risk factors and reproductive health of women.** *Occup Med (Lond)*. 2006 Dec;56(8):521-31.

Gonzalez-Ramirez D, Maiorino RM, Zuniga-Charles M: **Sodium 2,3-dimercaptopropane-1-sulfonate challenge test for mercury in humans: II. Urinary mercury, porphyrins and neurobehavioral changes of dental workers in Monterrey, Mexico.** *J Pharmacol Exp Ther* 1995 , **272**:264-274.

Heyer NJ, Echeverria D, Bittner AJ, Farin FM, Garabedian CC, Woods JS: **Chronic low-level mercury exposure, BDNF polymorphism, and associations with self-reported symptoms and mood.** *Toxicol Sci* 2004 , **81**:354-363.

Heyer NJ, Echeverria D, Farin FM, Woods JS. **The association between serotonin transporter gene promoter polymorphism (5-HTTLPR), self-reported symptoms, and dental mercury exposure.** *J Toxicol Environ Health A*. 2008;71(19):1318-26.

Hilt B, Svendsen K, Syversen T, Aas O, Qvenild T, Sletvold H, Melø I. **Occurrence of cognitive symptoms in dental assistants with previous occupational exposure to metallic mercury.** *Neurotoxicology*. 2009 Nov;30(6):1202-6.

Jones L, Bunnell J, Stillman J. **A 30-year follow-up of residual effects on New Zealand School Dental Nurses, from occupational mercury exposure.** *Hum Exp Toxicol*. 2007 Apr;26(4):367-74.

Karahalil B, Rahravi H, Ertas N. **Examination of urinary mercury levels in dentists in Turkey.** *Hum Exp Toxicol*. 2005 Aug;24(8):383-8.

Kasraei Sh, Mortazavi H, Vahedi M, Bakianian Vaziri P, Assary M. **Blood Mercury Level and Its Determinants among Dental Practitioners in Hamadan, Iran.** *J Dent (Tehran)*. 2010 Spring;7(2):55-63.

Langworth S, Sällsten G, Barregård L, Cynkier I, Lind ML, Söderman E. **Exposure to mercury vapor and impact on health in the dental profession in Sweden.** *J Dent Res*. 1997 Jul;76(7):1397-404.

Lehto T, Alanen P, Rönnemaa T, Helenius H, Kallio V. **Urinary mercury concentrations in Finnish dentists.** *Proc Finn Dent Soc*. 1989;85(3):177-85.

Lindbohm ML, Ylöstalo P, Sallmén M, Henriks-Eckerman ML, Nurminen T, Forss H, Taskinen H. **Occupational exposure in dentistry and miscarriage.** *Occup Environ Med*. 2007 Feb;64(2):127-33.

Linnet M S, Malmer H S, Chow W H. et al **Occupational risks for cutaneous melanoma among men in Sweden.** *J Occup Environ Med* 1995. 371127–1135.1135.

Meltzer H, Griffiths C, Brock A, Rooney C, Jenkins R. **Patterns of suicide by occupation in England and Wales: 2001-2005.** *Br J Psychiatry*. 2008 Jul;193(1):73-6.

Moen B, Hollund B, Riise T. **Neurological symptoms among dental assistants: a cross-sectional study.** *J Occup Med Toxicol*. 2008 May 18;3:10.

Molin M, Schütz A, Skerfving S, Sällsten G. **Mobilized mercury in subjects with varying exposure to elemental mercury vapour.** *Int Arch Occup Environ Health*. 1991;63(3):187-92.

Navas - Acien A, Pollan M, Gustavsson P. et al **Occupation, exposure to chemicals and risk of gliomas and meningiomas in Sweden.** *Am J Ind Med* 2002. 42:214–227.

Navas - Acien A, Pollan M, Gustavsson P. et al **Interactive effect of chemical substances and occupational electromagnetic field exposure on the risk of gliomas and meningiomas in Swedish men.** *Cancer Epidemiol Biomarkers Prev* 2002. 11:1678–1683.

Neghab M, Choobineh A, Hassan Zadeh J, Ghaderi E. **Symptoms of intoxication in dentists associated with exposure to low levels of mercury.** *Ind Health.* 2011;49(2):249-54.

Ngim CH, Foo SC, Boey KW, Jeyaratnam J. **Chronic neurobehavioural effects of elemental mercury in dentists.** *Br J Ind Med.* 1992 Nov;49(11):782-90.

Nilsson B, Nilsson B. Mercury in dental practice. II. **Urinary mercury excretion in dental personnel.** *Swed Dent J.* 1986;10(6):221-32.

Nylander M, Friberg L, Eggleston D, Björkman L. **Mercury accumulation in tissues from dental staff and controls in relation to exposure.** *Swed Dent J.* 1989;13(6):235-43.

Pan J, Song H, Pan XC. **Reproductive effects of occupational exposure to mercury on female workers in China: a meta-analysis.** *Zhonghua Liu Xing Bing Xue Za Zhi.* 2007 Dec;28(12):1215-8.

Petersen MR, Burnett CA. **The suicide mortality of working physicians and dentists.** *Occup Med (Lond).* 2008 Jan;58(1):25-9.

Ritchie KA, Burke FJ, Gilmour WH, Macdonald EB, Dale IM, Hamilton RM, McGowan DA, Binnie V, Collington D, Hammersley R. **Mercury vapour levels in dental practices and body mercury levels of dentists and controls.** *Br Dent J.* 2004 Nov 27;197(10):625-32; discussion 621.

Ritchie KA, Gilmour WH, Macdonald EB, Burke FJ, McGowan DA, Dale IM, Hammersley R, Hamilton RM, Binnie V, Collington D: **Health and neuropsychological functioning of dentists exposed to mercury.** *J Occup Environ Med* 2002, 59:287-293.

Ritchie KA, Macdonald EB, Hammersley R, O'Neil JM, McGowan DA, Dale IM, Wesnes K: **A pilot study of the effect of low level exposure to mercury on the health of dental surgeons.** *J Occup Environ Med* 1995 , 52:813-817.

Rix B A, Lyng E. **Cancer incidence in Danish health care workers.** *Scand J Soc Med* 1996. 24:114–120.

Rowland AS, Baird DD, Weinberg CR, Shore DL, Shy CM, Wilcox AJ. **The effect of occupational exposure to mercury vapour on the fertility of female dental assistants.** *Occup Environ Med.* 1994 Jan;51(1):28-34.

Samir AM, Aref WM. **Impact of occupational exposure to elemental mercury on some antioxidative enzymes among dental staff.** *Toxicol Ind Health.* 2011 Oct;27(9):779-86.

Schach V, Jahanbakht S, Livardjani F, Flesch F, Jaeger A, Haikel Y. **Le risque mercuriel dans les cabinets dentaires : histoire ancienne ou futur proche ?** INRS, 2003.

Shapiro IM, Cornblath DR, Sumner AJ, Uzzell B, Spitz LK, Ship II, Bloch P. **Neurophysiological and neuropsychological function in mercury-exposed dentists.** *Lancet.* 1982 May 22;1(8282):1147-50.

Simning A, van Wijngaarden E. **Literature review of cancer mortality and incidence among dentists.** *Occup Environ Med.* 2007 Jul;64(7):432-8.

Skare I, Bergström T, Engqvist A, Weiner JA. **Mercury exposure of different origins among dentists and dental nurses.** *Scand J Work Environ Health.* 1990 Oct;16(5):340-7.

Steinberg D, Grauer F, Niv Y, Perlyte M, Kopolovic K. **Mercury levels among dental personnel in Israel: a preliminary study.** *Isr J Med Sci.* 1995 Jul;31(7):428-32.

Tezel H, Ertas OS, Ozata F, Erakin C, Kayali A: **Blood mercury levels of dental students and dentists at a dental school.** *Br Dent J* 2001 , 191:449-452.

Uzzell BP, Oler J. **Chronic low-level mercury exposure and neuropsychological functioning.** *J Clin Exp Neuropsychol.* 1986 Oct;8(5):581-93.

Vagero D, Swerdlow A J, Beral V. **Occupation and malignant melanoma: a study based on cancer registration data in England and Wales and in Sweden.** *Br J Ind Med* 1990. 47317–324.324.

Verschoor MA, Herber RF, Zielhuis RL. **Urinary mercury levels and early changes in kidney function in dentists and dental assistants.** *Community Dent Oral Epidemiol.* 1988 Jun;16(3):148-52.

Warwick R, O'Connor A, Lamey B. **Mercury vapour exposure during dental student training in amalgam removal.** *J Occup Med Toxicol.* 2013 Oct 3;8(1):27.

Zander D, Ewers U, Freier I, Brockhaus A. [Mercury exposure of the population. IV. **Mercury exposure of male dentists, female dentists and dental aides.** *Zentralbl Hyg Umweltmed.* 1992 Dec;193(4):318-28.